

GENDERING MEN :
THEORIZING MASCULINITIES IN AMERICAN CULTURE AND
LITERATURE

José María Armengol Carrera

Directora: Dra. Àngels Carabí Ribera

Tesi doctoral

Per optar al títol de doctor en Filologia Anglesa

Programa de doctorat “Literatures i cultures”

Bienni 2000-2002

Departament de Filologia Anglesa i Alemanya

Universitat de Barcelona

For my late grandmother, Rosa Campi Arderiu,
in loving memory

Contents

Acknowledgments	i
Introduction	1
Part I	
Preliminary Theory	
1. Studies of masculinities in the United States: an introduction	
1.1. Origins	38
1.2. Development of American studies of masculinities	45
1.3. The politics of masculinity studies in the United States	54
1.4. Men in feminism	60
1.5. Masculinity studies: new directions	70
2. Poststructuralism and the dissolution of (American) white heterosexual male identity: implications for this study	
2.1. Interrogating maleness and masculinity	80
2.2. Interrogating heterosexuality	91
2.3. Interrogating whiteness	96
2.4. Poststructuralist vs. identity-based approaches to masculinity: introducing the debate	108
2.5. Rethinking the debate	122
2.6. Analyzing (American) white heterosexual masculinity as a variable and heterogeneous gender construct	135
2.7. Discussing masculinities from an interdisciplinary methodology	153
Part II	
Themes	
3. Big boys don't cry? Masculinity and the politics of emotion in American culture	
3.1. The feminization of sentiment in American culture	166
3.2. Boys don't cry? Rethinking traditional (mis)conceptions of masculinity as unemotional	188

3.3. The “soft male” as social phenomenon	196
3.4. Emotion <i>versus/as</i> social change: introducing the debate	203
3.5. The political potential of profeminist men’s emotions to transform masculinities and gender relations	219
4. Studies of American literary masculinities: an introduction	
4.1. Origins and development	241
4.2. Masculinity studies in American literary criticism	261
4.3. Men in feminist literary criticism	270
4.4. The sex and/or the death of the author	282
5. Gendering violence: the (de)construction of masculinity as violence in American culture and literature	
5.1. Gendering violence: theoretical explanations for the relationship between masculinity and violence	298
5.2. Male violence in contemporary American culture	310
5.3. Images of violence as a test of manhood in American cultural and literary history	318
5.4. Re-visions of male violence in contemporary American literature	343
Conclusions	379
Works Cited	399

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to express my enormous gratitude to Dr. Àngels Carabí, my thesis advisor. She has always had the ability to keep one eye on the big picture (to think “big,” as she says) and the other on the smallest detail. Besides directing my thesis, Dr. Carabí also gave me the opportunity to work as a research assistant at the *Center for Women and Literature/Centre Dona i Literatura* at the University of Barcelona, which she co-founded with Dr. Marta Segarra, and, later on, to participate in the officially funded research project “Construyendo nuevas masculinidades: la representación de la masculinidad en la literatura y el cine de los Estados Unidos (1980-2003)” (Ministerio de Trabajo y Asuntos Sociales, Instituto de la Mujer, Exp. nº 62/03, 2004-2006). Besides enlarging my CV, personal contacts, and publications, working with Dr. Carabí helped me to place a high value on the more important aspects of ethical responsibility, friendship, and team work.

Sharing a perennial interest in masculinity studies, Dr. Àngels Carabí and I have participated together in many academic projects and activities. Of the numerous conferences on men and masculinities that we have attended

together, I particularly remember the three days we spent in Jerez de la Frontera, where we attended the *First Spanish National Conference on Men and Masculinities* (Jerez de la Frontera's City Hall, November 2001). I have equally good memories of our research trip to New York in the summer of 2003, which resulted in the publication of the DVD (and forthcoming book) *Debating Masculinity*, a collection of interviews to some of the leading masculinity scholars in the United States. Through shared memories like these ones, Dr. Carabí and I have thus come to blur the distinctions between collegueship and friendship.

My thanks go as well to Dr. Michael Kimmel, who runs the interdisciplinary *Research Center for Men and Masculinities* (Department of Sociology, State University of New York at Stony Brook), where I did research three consecutive summers (2001-2003) and one winter (2004-2005). Besides offering his own help and advice, Dr. Kimmel helped me to contact many of the leading masculinity scholars. I am grateful to Dr. Kimmel and his family, Amy and Zachary, for making my stay such a pleasure. I also thank Dr. David Leverenz (English Department, University of Florida) for academic advice and support. Although this work stands on the foundation laid by many scholars, I must record a special debt to Dr.

David L. Eng (English Department, Rutgers University) and Dr. Carolyn Dinshaw (*Center for the Study of Gender and Sexuality*, New York University), whom Dr. Carabí and I had the pleasure and honor to interview, and whose ideas have had an enormous influence on this study. I would also like to express my gratitude to Dr. Ana I. Zamorano (English Department, UNED) for her interest in my research work on men and masculinities, and for increasingly incorporating the study of masculinity into the panel on “Feminist and Gender Studies” that she chairs at the annual AEDEAN (Asociación Española de Estudios Anglonorteamericanos) Conference.

My thanks go as well to several other scholars from the English Department at the University of Barcelona. As a member of the research project “Construyendo nuevas masculinidades” of this Department, I have had the immense pleasure as well as the honor to collaborate with Dr. Bill Phillips and Dr. Rodrigo Andrés, whose knowledge and opinions have proved absolutely essential for this thesis. I am equally grateful to María Isabel Seguro, another colleague of the project on masculinities, who helped to round off the introduction to this thesis. Thanks to Mercè Cuenca for her moral support. I remain equally indebted to the scholarly example set by Dr. Carme Muñoz. After working with her for almost two years as a research

assistant, I can attest to both her intellectual and human worth. From Dr. Muñoz I learnt, above all else, the essential value of constancy and hard work. Dr. Jacqueline A. Hurlley has repeatedly shown her interest in my thesis and research papers, providing many valuable comments on my academic output. Her excellent postgraduate course in “Women and Literature” has inspired much of this project. I am also grateful to Dr. Marta Segarra (*Center for Women and Literature*, Department of Romance Philology, University of Barcelona), whom I admire especially for her enormous capacity for work. Last but not least, Dr. Jesús Contreras (Department of Anthropology, University of Barcelona) has proved a kind advisor as well.

As anyone who has engaged in a project similar to this one may attest, getting the time (and the money) to write a thesis is not easy at all. My parents, Josep Armengol and Maria Rosa Carrera, have always been supportive of me (sometimes financially as well), and my brother, Esteve, has always given me meaningful advice on both life and work. Special thanks to all those friends who have provided me with their emotional support. In particular, I would like to thank Natalia Fullana for inviting me to spend one week in her home in Canada in the summer of 2002. That

holiday proved a necessary relief from work. Xavier Fainé has become another faithful friend. Since we first met each other in New York City in the summer of 2001, he has been constantly supportive, providing me with both moral encouragement and a wonderful leisure time. My thanks go as well to Joan Àlvar Cañellas, Dr. Carabí's son, who also proved to be a good friend while I was in New York in the summer of 2001. When traveling to a foreign country for the first time, it is always nice to be welcomed by a friendly voice.

Finally, this project is institutionally indebted to the two pre-doctoral research grants (January 2000-December 2003, August 2004-January 2005) that I was awarded by the DURSI (Departament d'Universitats, Recerca i Societat de la Informació, Generalitat de Catalunya). Since funding for research work in the humanities is generally scarce (to say the least), these pre-doctoral grants proved a remarkable asset. I hope that the moral and financial support I received from all these people and institutions will be reflected in this work. This study is dedicated to the memory of my late grandmother, Rosa Campi Arderiu, who would be particularly satisfied with its completion.